

Desert Skies Symposium on Research in Music Education 2017 Abstracts

PAPER SESSION 2

Ethics Training in Music Education Curricula: Florida Colleges and Universities as a Model

Robert Clark, Florida State University

Music teachers, like educators in all other disciplines, are expected to meet certain ethical standards such as those set forth in the National Education Association's code of ethics, while also meeting musical goals (Lien, 2012; Rodriguez, 2012.) A sample of the behaviors required of a music educator include teaching musical skills, technique, history, and aesthetics while also protecting children, taking care of public property such as school-owned instruments, maintaining high moral character within the school and community, and behaving according to professional expectations within the school setting (Lien, 2012; Rodriguez, 2012.) Scant research has examined the occurrences, frequency, and nature of disciplinary actions against music educators. Simpson (2009) surveyed a sample of the large Florida Department of Educators Discipline Against Educator License database. In that survey, he found that less than 5% of the sampled population were music teachers. However, 60% of offending music teachers had been disciplined for sexual misconduct. Shakeshaft and Cohan (1995) reported that teachers who spend large amounts of one-to-one time are likely to commit child sexual abuse. Simpson notes that such a finding should be "of particular concern for music educators" due to the nature of time spent with students (p. 58.)

As of this writing, the Florida Department of Education does not require universities and colleges to provide an ethics course in order for students to receive teacher certification (Florida Department of Education, 2016.) The current policy of FDOE requires individual school districts to provide ethics training, choosing from a "broad range of topics" (para. 1.) In this training, the only "statutory obligations" are review of policies in reporting of neglect/abuse and the "Code of Ethics of the Education Profession in Florida" (para 3.) From this information it would seem that concern for "legal" issues has superseded those for "moral" and "ethical" decision making processes. Regelski (2012) has identified a current ethical dilemma facing music educators as one of "musicianism"—that music educators are loyal to values developed through one's music training, resulting in an emphasis that is more on "music" and less on "education." Regelski stated that universities have historically been the source of "musicianism" by preparing students to be "musicians first, and educators second" (p. 2.) Lien (2012) wrote that "...ethics education of any standardized or formalized nature is virtually nonexistent in music education" (p. 81.)

The purpose of this study was to determine whether ethics training is a requirement to receive a Bachelor's degree in Music Education, using Florida colleges and universities as a model. This study also sought to determine how ethics classes are taught (stand-alone, seminar, cross-curricular) and which part of the school administered the class (Colleges of Education, Music, etc.) The curriculum guides of all Florida public

and private colleges and universities which confer a BME (N = 20) were examined. Keywords established from previous research (Maxwell, Trambly-Laprise, Filion, Boon, Daly, van den Hoven, Heilbronn, Lenselink, & Walters, 2016) were employed to determine if the music education curriculum for each school required an ethics-focused course. The course descriptions were reviewed to determine in which department or school the class was administered and the format of the class (seminar or stand-alone.) Expert reviewers read and independently classified course titles and descriptions according to the set of keywords. Reliability was calculated using the formula of Madsen and Madsen (2016) with 100% reliability.

The primary finding of this study was that compulsory ethics instruction courses were included in the curricula of less than half (45%) of Florida colleges and universities that confer the Bachelor's Degree in Music Education. Further, 88% of the sample of ethics classes examined in this study were stand-alone format, and 88% of classes were taught in the Department/School/College of Education at their respective institutions. This finding is somewhat reflective of the work of Maxwell, et. al (2016) who reported that only 16% of the American colleges surveyed included required ethics-related courses for education majors, or Glanzer and Ream (2007) in whose study only 9% of colleges had a required ethics class in their education curricula. Maxwell, et. al found inequity of emphasis on ethics by country: in their study, Canada was more likely to include stand-alone ethics courses in education majors' curricula than the United States or Australia (p. 138.) Glanzer and Ream pointed to inequity of emphasis between majors with business, law, engineering, social work, and studies in the medical field requiring ethics training far more often than education curricula.

The number of schools requiring ethics training for the BME in Florida does reflect a higher frequency than those in the results of the studies discussed. Implications of the results for music education are discussed and further research is suggested with the aim of expanding ethics training for preservice music educators.

The Suspension of a Music Degree Program: A Case Study of Flawed Process and a Cautionary Tale

Kathy Norman Dearden, University of North Dakota

In 1883, six years before North Dakota entered the Federal Union, the University of North Dakota was established in Grand Forks. As a part of the curriculum since 1884 and a major area of study for 100 years, music has been an important part of University life. The value placed on music extends to the community, where the city band, choir and orchestra, like the University's music major, have been in existence for over a century. The public schools place a similarly high value on music, with well-regarded programs offered at all levels, K-12. For the past 14 years in a row, the National Association of Music Merchants named Grand Forks among their best communities for music education.

In Fall 2015, the University's Music Department had reached a new high enrollment of 179 majors and a graduating class of 38, nearly equaling the halcyon days of the mid-70s when the Department had been a dynamic, thriving center of music

learning. Aging faculty, retirements and budgetary challenges contributed to a decline, so severe that the number of majors dwindled to the point that by 1994, there were only four music graduates. Fortunately, with hires of new faculty, inspired leadership and development of programs, the Department reversed the decline and began to grow. After its establishment as a new program in 1999, Music Therapy was the engine that drove the growth. As an emerging discipline and the only program of its kind between Minneapolis and Seattle, Music Therapy drew students to UND. As the Music Therapy program grew, so did the rest of the Department. With more music majors, the ensembles performed better and standards across the Department, in general, rose.

By fall of 2015, with its majors, capped at 50, Music Therapy represented about one third of the Department's undergraduates, another third were in music education and the final third were split between majors in music performance and the Bachelor of Arts in music. Excellence attracts and the prospects for the Department had never looked better. Approval had been given to hire a second tenure-track professor in music therapy and by January 2016, plans were underway to bring the top candidate to campus. In the State, however, things were not going well. The oil boom, which had buoyed North Dakota's economy through the great recession of 2008 had gone bust with the downturn in prices of Saudi Arabian crude.

So, on February 4th, 2016, the Governor announced a higher education budget reduction of 4.05%. The University's Interim President told Deans to prepare for more aggressive cuts and possible elimination of programs in low-priority areas. Nonetheless, approval was given for the on-campus music therapy interview; on February 12th, a recommendation to hire was made from the Department to the Dean. Three weeks later, the Department was informed that the tenure-track search in music therapy was suspended, that no new students would be accepted into Music Therapy, and that current students would be "taught out."

This sent the Department—its students, staff and faculty—into turmoil. Faculty argued that they were not consulted, that four levels of strategic plan were disregarded and curriculum process ignored, that the 18% budget reduction forced on Music was unfair, that cutting a program with 50 majors saves no money, that rationales advanced by the administration were misinformed and misleading. Students marched in protest at the President's house. An avalanche of protest e-mail descended upon the University Administration, the State Board of Higher Education and the Chancellor. Music therapy had served the community well and many concerned and angry people voiced their objections on the radio and in letters to the local newspaper. The NDMEA hosted a "Save Music Therapy" online petition. With the situation drawing national attention, singer-songwriter Ben Folds and neuroscientist-author Daniel Levitin offered to stage a benefit concert to raise money for the program—but it was all to no avail.

Faculty began the Fall 2016 semester with fewer students; fourth week data indicated that the undergraduate Music enrollment had fallen to 125, the drop extending beyond Music Therapy into the Performance and Music Education programs. Projections show that if the rate of decline is not slowed, by 2020 when the last of the music therapy students are "taught out," undergraduate music major enrollment will be 63.

Documentation for this case study is taken from North Dakota University System policies, University records, related e-mail, newspaper articles and personal written

accounts. It is a study of flawed process. It is also a cautionary tale, which raises many questions. Among them are: Do you have safeguards for shared governance on your campus? Can “administrative action” supersede curriculum process? Who decides what is high priority? Is there any recourse?

An Investigation of Learner-Centered Instruction and Teacher-Centered Instruction in a High School Wind Band Class

Kenneth Goff, University of Arkansas-Little Rock

Classroom instructional styles are a frequently discussed issue in education. Calls by professional organizations have encouraged teachers to take a more learner-centered approach to classroom structure. Government mandates have encouraged teachers to implement a learner-centered approach because learner-centered instruction has been shown to encourage critical thinking skills. Despite teacher-centered instruction being the dominantly used instructional style, research has shown that there are many benefits of a learner-centered environment. Benefits that include: improved grades, personal satisfaction, academic motivation, improved attendance, and increased participation. The scope of the study was to determine what effects learner-centered instruction may have on a wind band performance, student attitudes, and student perceptions.

A high school band was divided into two similar bands. The divided bands were assigned the same piece of music to rehearse for six weeks, three times a week. Each rehearsal was ten minutes. The divided groups rehearsed at the same time during the academic day and in separate rooms. The groups alternated rehearsal rooms to insure similar acoustical experiences. One band director was assigned a teacher-centered instructional style (control) and another band director was assigned a learner-centered instructional style (treatment).

Following the six week rehearsal period, high school band directors (N = 47) evaluated pre and post-test performances based on performance characteristics (note accuracy, rhythm accuracy, tone quality, intonation, expressiveness, and overall performance). The researcher conducted t-tests for statistical differences between the two bands. The study’s results indicated that there was a significant difference showing greater improvement toward the teacher-centered ensemble on all of the performance characteristics except rhythm accuracy where no difference between ensembles was reported. The results appear to be contrary to previous research.

Students rated their attitudes toward their band experiences using a pre-test and post-test questionnaire. The students in the teacher-centered ensemble indicated decreased class enjoyment and decreased anticipation to band class but the students did report increased musical enjoyment and at home practice. The students in the learner-centered ensemble indicated increased at home practice but decreased class enjoyment and anticipation to band. A report of decreased class enjoyment in the learner-centered ensemble does seem to be contrary to previous research.

Student perceptions of musical growth were compared between the teacher-centered group and learner-centered group. Students rated their musical growth as a result

of their band rehearsals. The results were compared and no significance was indicated between groups.

The results of the study appear to be contrary to previous research. Based on the findings of the present study, band directors may want to reevaluate their teaching styles. Previous literature suggests the many benefits of learner-centered instruction but as indicated by the current study, teacher-centered instruction was shown to have benefits especially when comparing performance outcomes. Music educators who seek to expand their teaching styles may benefit from some approaches used with learner-centered instruction. The strict definition and training used in the study could warrant an argument that previous research may have used a combination of learner-centered and teacher-centered instruction, as a result, a possible solution for educators may be the use of a hybrid of the two strategies. A mixed approach could facilitate more student involvement within a more controlled environment.

Finding the Right Note: A Strategic Analysis of Sight Reading

Sarah Houghton, Boston University

Sight-reading remains a valuable skill for musicians but it presents a challenge for singers, who receive little proprioceptive feedback from the vocal cords and cannot employ an external mechanism for changing pitches (Sundberg, 1987). Scripp (1995) suggested that when instrumental musicians rely on motor movements elicited from reading music notation, “music reading skills...do not necessarily support a broader understanding of the symbol system” (p. 5). Vocal sight-reading may necessitate (and reveal) a more authentic understanding (or misunderstanding) of the symbol system, beyond which can be seen in instrumental sight-reading. Without an external mechanism, singers must inevitably rely on other methods, or strategies, for negotiating notation.

Strategy use in vocal sight-reading is the way students “employ deliberate, goal-directed mental operations” in order to complete the task of vocal sight-reading, such as tonicizing the key or scanning the music for potential difficulties (Bjorklund, 2011, p. 265). Sight-readers use many behavioral and cognitive strategies to accomplish the task, such as tapping the beat, scanning the music for problematic areas, internally singing the tonic and dominant chords, or returning to the tonic after mistakes (Thomson, 2003, 2004; Edgington, 2005). Interestingly, strategy use can be a consistent and strong predictor of sight-reading scores, and low sight-reading scores can be attributed to lack of strategy use (McPherson, 2005; Scripp, 1995). These strategies have been objectively observed and self-reported in both children and adults but infrequently studied by combining objective sight-reading performance and self-reported thought process data (Scripp, 1995; Thomson, 2004). Moreover, there has been little research in strategy use with choral singers, and no studies, to my knowledge, of strategy use of middle-school age choral singers.

The conceptual framework for this study was the combination of audiation from Music Learning Theory and empirical research from the body of Cognitive Science in music cognition. This combined framework highlighted the role of cognitive processes (perception, attention, memory, audiation) in the vocal sight-reading process and

facilitated the investigation of how participants' strategies improved or reduced sight-reading performance. Studying the strategy use of middle school choral singers, using the combination of sight-reading performance and verbal data, offered a new perspective on the extent to which singers understand the symbol system and how choral students learn to read notation. The purpose of this study was to elucidate: the condition and character of strategies used, the congruence of self-reported and observed strategies, and the influence of quality of strategy used on vocal sight-singing achievement. The participants were 19 eighth-grade choral students (pilot n = 5, 2 males; main study n = 14, 4 males).

Data collection took place at students' home middle schools, in a practice room. Participants: 1) performed six vocal sight-reading tasks (Vocal Sight-Reading Inventory; Henry, 1999), 2) vocalized thought processes during retrospective think-aloud protocols (Ericsson & Simon, 1993), 3) detailed self-reported sight-reading strategies in short, structured interviews, and, 4) explained decisions during video-stimulated recall interviews. I met with students individually, for approximately 30 minutes, and recorded researcher observations during data collection. Sight-reading scores were based on single-note accurate performance (either in the original or newly-established key). To assess strategy use proficiency, I designed a Sophistication of Strategy Use Index, whereby I assigned scores to participants' strategies in five cognition categories, looking behavior, chunking, long-term memory, auditory representations, and audiation, by combining sight-reading performance and verbal data.

For the quantitative data, there was a wide range of scores for both the sight-reading measure and the Strategy Use Sophistication Index. The sophistication of strategy use scores were strongly correlated with vocal sight-reading scores ($r = .84$, $p < .01$, two-tailed). Other variables such as maintaining the tonal center were also strongly correlated with strategy use scores. For the qualitative data, all students employed strategies, both cognitive and non-cognitive, singularly and in combination.

The major findings of this study were: 1) Students' strategies can reveal musical understanding or misunderstanding not measureable with a typical correct/incorrect scoring system; 2) The more sophisticated the strategy, the more participants' skills in three modalities (aural, visual, and verbal) intersected; and 3) Employing musical auditory expectancy was foremost for participants in successful initial and error recovery strategy implementation. Results from the current study have implications for choral music educators in sight-reading assessment and in designing and implementing sight-reading curricula, especially with regards to content and pedagogy. Suggestions for teaching sight-reading include a multifaceted strategic approach, incorporating and scaffolding multiple modalities, and expanded assessment criteria.

References

- Bjorklund, D. (2011). *Children's thinking*. New York, NY: Cengage Learning.
- Edgington, R. A. (2005). The perceptions of musicians toward their use of cognitive skills in reading music at sight: Q-methodological study (Doctoral dissertation). Retrieved from ProQuest Digital Dissertations. (AAT No. 3181662)
- Ericsson, K. A., & Simon, H. A. (1993). *Protocol analysis: Verbal reports as data* (rev. ed.). Cambridge, MA: MIT Press.
- Gordon, E. E. (2007). *Learning sequences in music: A contemporary music learning theory*. Chicago, IL: GIA Publications.

- Henry, M. L. (1999). The development of an individual vocal sight-reading inventory (Doctoral dissertation). Retrieved from ProQuest Digital Dissertations. (AAT No. 9921434)
- McPherson, G. E. (2005). From child to musician: Skill development during the beginning stages of learning an instrument. *Psychology of Music*, 33(1), 5-35.
- Scripp, L. (1995). The development of skill in reading music (Vol. 1) (Doctoral dissertation). Retrieved from ProQuest Digital Dissertations. (AAT No. 9534633)
- Sundberg, J. (1987). *The science of the singing voice*. Dekalb, IL: Northern Illinois University Press.
- Thompson, K. A. (2003). Pitch internalization strategies of professional musicians (Doctoral dissertation). Retrieved from ProQuest Digital Dissertations. (AAT No. 3082945)
- Thompson, K. A. (2004). Thinking in sound: A qualitative study of metaphors for pitch perception. *Journal of Music Theory Pedagogy*, 18, 81–108.

Bucking Social Justice Trends: An Intrinsic Case Study of a Biracial Preservice Music Educator, His Atypical Perspectives on Diversity and Social Justice Issues in Music Education, and Their Implications for the Profession

Tiger Robison, University of Maryland

Issues of diversity, equity, inclusion, and social justice have been recent topics of scholarly investigation in music education (e.g., McKoy, 2012). Perhaps because of recent unpleasantness (Cooper, 2016), these issues have been the focus of national gatherings of music education scholars (Big Ten Academic Alliance) and general discussion. However, there are relatively few published studies in which preservice music educators of color have shared their perspectives on diversity issues in their own words (Carter, 2013; Fitzpatrick, Henninger, & Taylor, 2014). Furthermore, I found no published studies in which participants shared views on diversity and social justice issues similar to those of Clark.

Clark is a freshman undergraduate music education major who plays tenor saxophone, studies jazz, volunteers his time to university outreach projects, reads research about music education for students with special needs, and requests regular office hours with music education faculty members. Clark is biracial with Black and White racial ancestry. He also identifies with the political Right and has *The Wall Street Journal* delivered to his dorm room each day. Generally, he holds views that are respectful but antithetical to current trends in music education related to diversity, equity, inclusion, and social justice.

The purpose of this intrinsic case study is to examine Clark's experiences and upbringing to collect his perspectives on current diversity and social justice trends in music education. Through his responses and data collection from multiple sources, I hope to contextualize his views with the purpose of better defining his counter arguments to the renewed efforts for diversity and social justice in music education today. Although data collection and analysis is still ongoing, Clark's views and how he came to have them

are becoming more clear. For example, in a journal entry response to a prompt about students going through identity crises, Clark wrote:

His background is his own, and however he wishes to express that will be accepted not by bringing unnatural attention to it, but by dealing with his identity the same way I deal with everyone else's. I believe...that speaking out in support of one child's identity draws attention to the fact that it needs to be defended. What is a stronger statement; telling the group that we accept all gender and sexual identities, or never stopping to think that we wouldn't?

In follow up interviews with Clark's parents, I learned that one of Clark's high school concert band mates made the transition from a man to a woman. They recalled how the band family (or "Bamily") and greater community discussed the issues and how they believed those discussions shaped Clark's current views. Ultimately, they remarked that Clark joined band to play music and that they perceived Clark viewed those discussions as a distraction from the original reason he joined band.

On issues of race and music education, Clark does not believe in affirmative action nor does he think diversifying the music education workforce or student body should be a concerted effort. For him, all acceptances into positions should be merit-based alone. Clark was the first biracial drum major in recent memory at his high school, but he ignored all people who praised him but commented on his race. However, in the same interview with me, Clark recalled a bitter moment when he was, "pulled over for driving while Black" on the way home from a band competition.

The purpose of any intrinsic case study is to focus on the case itself because it presents an unusual or unique situation (Creswell, 2007, p. 100). Additionally, after preliminary data analysis, I discern several larger points in this study that merit further research and discussion in the music education profession. First, despite widespread trends in viewing music education as a context for diversity and social justice, there are people for whom this state of affairs is undesirable, even members of marginalized populations themselves. Second, if Clark's experiences are any indication, people who do not identify with these trends, ironically, may feel marginalized once they express their views. Finally, if robust discussions about diversity and social justice are to continue throughout the profession, stakeholders would be wise to include dissenting perspectives such as Clark's in order to strengthen any side of the argument.

References

- Big Ten Academic Alliance. Policy, politics, and the practice of music education. Retrieved from <http://www.cicmusiced.com/2016-conference>
- Carter, B. A. (2013). "Nothing better or worse than being black, gay, and in the band": A qualitative examination of gay undergraduates participating in Historically Black College or University marching bands. *Journal of Research in Music Education*, 61(1), 26–43. doi:10.1177/0022429412474470
- Cooper, M. (2016, May 12). Music education group's leader departs after remarks on diversity. *The New York Times*. Retrieved from <http://www.nytimes.com>
- Creswell, J. W. (2007). *Qualitative inquiry and research design: Choosing among five approaches* (2nd ed.). London, England: Sage.

- Fitzpatrick, K. R., Henninger, J. C., & Taylor, D. M. (2014). Access and retention of marginalized populations within undergraduate music education degree programs. *Journal of Research in Music Education*, 62(2), 105–127. doi:10.1177/0022429414530760
- McKoy, C. L. (2012). Effects of selected demographic variables on music student teachers' self-reported cross-cultural competence. *Journal of Research in Music Education*, 60(4), 375–394. doi:10.1177/0022429412463398