

Desert Skies Symposium on Research in Music Education 2017 Abstracts

PAPER SESSION 4

Student Perceptions of Recruitment and Retention Strategies In Low Socioeconomic Beginning String Programs

Mallory Alekna, Arizona State University

The investigation of recruitment and retention strategies of beginning string programs is necessary to develop effective ways of encouraging students to join and stay in orchestra. Since research has shown that participation in music ensembles has benefits for students (Costa-Giomi, 2004; Kraus et al., 2014), promoting student participation is crucial to allowing all students access to high quality learning experiences. Research has found that low socioeconomic status (SES) schools have less access to music instruction (Elpus & Abril, 2011), especially orchestra (Smith, 1997). The adult perspective of recruitment and retention has been documented (Abril, 2009; Albert, 2005; Fitzpatrick, 2011); yet, student perceptions of recruitment and retention strategies in schools of low SES have been minimally investigated (Cook, 2013; Vasil, 2013). The purpose of this study was to understand students' perceptions of recruitment and retention strategies in above average enrollment beginning group string programs within low SES communities.

Two schools from a large, Midwestern city that qualified as having high orchestra enrollment and low SES were selected for the study. Ten sixth grade beginning string students, five from each school, completed an individual interview lasting approximately fifteen minutes. Research questions regarding students' perceptions of recruitment and retention strategies, including their teachers' and community members' role in these processes, were used to guide the interview questions. Classroom observations and informal teacher interviews were conducted at each school to confirm what was being heard in the interviews (Maxwell, 2005). The data was analyzed through emergent category coding (Merriam, 1998). The data were analyzed within each school as a case to gather a complete picture of what the students perceived regarding recruitment and retention. Then, the data were compared between the two different schools to discover any common themes. Member checking was conducted with the students after data analysis to provide the participants the opportunity to review the findings and ensure accurate collection and interpretation of the data (Creswell, 2007).

Findings regarding students' perceptions of recruitment included the themes of verbal recruitment, orchestra as a means to self-growth, and orchestra as a low-pressure decision. Bryan explained how his teacher verbally recruited him into the program during his general music class, stating, "The number one person who changed my mind to join orchestra was [my teacher]...she told us about the things we would be able to do." Regarding retention, students perceived enjoyment of gaining skills, being with friends, receiving incentives, potential career and scholarship opportunities, and middle school class choices as impacting their decision to remain in a string program. For example, Alison made it clear that choosing between new opportunities was a tough decision, stating, "Next year is complicated. I'm going over to [the middle school] and it's either

strings or robotics. And robotics is pretty awesome.” Students considered their verbal interactions with their teachers differently with one school’s students saying they regularly talked to their teacher outside class and about non-music topics while students at the second school said they never talked to their teacher outside of class. Students had a range of perceptions regarding their teachers with some seeing them as encouraging and others as discouraging their retention in orchestra. Rose explained this perception, stating, “Sometimes she's nice, but I'm not going to say she's mean, but she can get you to a place where you don't want to do it any more.” Finally, teacher-facilitated recruitment events, such as elementary concerts and professional orchestra field trips, were the most frequently reported ways that students were exposed to orchestra prior to joining a program.

Students’ perceptions of recruitment strategies were aligned with current research, but, in contrast to the current literature (Albert, 2005; Vasil, 2013), were focused on specific experiences rather than on whole recruitment events. In line with previous research, students indicated that friends (Vasil, 2013) and middle school class choices (Cook, 2013) played a role in their retention. However, the previously examined role of teacher relationships (Shields, 2001) and career opportunities (Abeles, 2004) were not clearly represented in the current findings. In contrast to what was reported by teachers in previous research (Fitzpatrick, 2011; Shields, 2009), students in the current study did not perceive their teachers as influencing their retention. Confirming previous research (Albert, 2005), students perceived teacher-facilitated events as the most prevalent means of exposure to orchestra. In contrast to Vasil’s (2013) findings, students in the current study did not perceive instrument try out night as a meaningful recruitment factor. Additionally, students presented recruitment and retention strategies, such as joining orchestra as a means to self-growth, that are not immediately present in the extant literature. While hosting recruitment events may be an important strategy, the current study suggests that having the opportunity to talk with teachers or older orchestra members at these events is most meaningful to the students.

References

- Abeles, H. (2004). The effect of three orchestra/school partnerships on students’ interest in instrumental music instruction. *Journal of Research in Music Education, 52*, 248-263. doi: 10.2307/3345858
- Abril, C.R. (2009). Responding to culture in the instrumental music programme: teacher’s journey. *Music Education Research, 11*(1), 77-91. doi: 10.1080/14613800802699176
- Albert, D. J. (2005). *Instrumental music teachers' strategies to recruit and retain band students in low socioeconomic school districts* (Master’s thesis). Retrieved from ProQuest. (UMI 1429750)
- Cook, B. V. (2013). *An examination of factors contributing to orchestra students’ attrition in transition from elementary to middle school* (Unpublished doctoral dissertation). University of Michigan, Ann Arbor, MI.
- Costa-Giomi, E. (2004). Effects of three years of piano instruction on children's academic achievement, school performance and self-esteem. *Psychology of Music, 32*(2), 139-152. doi: 10.1177/030573560401491
- Creswell, J. W. (2007). *Qualitative inquiry & research design: Choosing among five approaches* (2nd Ed.). Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage Publications, Inc.

- Elpus, K., & Abril, C. R. (2011). High school music ensemble students in the united states a demographic profile. *Journal of Research in Music Education*, 59, 128-145. doi: 10.1177/0022429411405207
- Fitzpatrick, K. R. (2011). A mixed methods portrait of urban instrumental music teaching. *Journal of Research in Music Education*, 59, 229-256. doi: 10.1177/0022429411414912
- Hartley, L. A. & Porter, A. M. (2009). The influence of beginning instructional grade on string student enrollment, retention, and music performance. *Journal of Research in Music Education*, 56, 370-384. doi: 10.1177/0022429408329134
- Kraus, N., Slater, J., Thompson, E. C., Hornickel, J., Strait, D. L., Nicol, T., & White-Schwoch, T. (2014). Auditory learning through active engagement with sound: Biological impact of community music lessons in at-risk children. *Frontiers in Neuroscience*, 8(351), 1-13. doi: 10.3389/fnins.2014.00351
- Maxwell, J.A. (2005). *Qualitative research design: An interactive approach* (2nd Ed., Vol. 41). Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage Publications, Inc.
- Merriam, S. B. (1998). *Qualitative research and case study applications in education: Revised and expanded from "case study research in education"* (2nd Ed.). San Francisco, CA: Jossey-Bass Publishers.
- Shields, C. (2001). Music education and mentoring as intervention for at-risk urban adolescents: Their self-perceptions, opinions, and attitudes. *Journal of Research in Music Education*, 49, 273-286.2. doi: 10.2307/3345712
- Smith, C. M. (1997). Access to string instruction in American public schools. *Journal of Research in Music Education*, 45, 650-662. doi: 10.2307/3345429
- Vasil, M. (2013). Extrinsic motivators affecting fourth-grade students' interest and enrollment in an instrumental music program. *Update: Applications of Research in Music Education*, 32(1), 74-82. doi: 10.1177/8755123313502345

The Effect of Conductor Gender on Ensemble Evaluations

Julia Baumanis, Florida State University

Gender division in the United States has been an ongoing topic of interest. As early as 1923, legislation was introduced to Congress supporting equal rights for women (U.S. Const. amend. XIX). Since then, researchers have tracked the progression of gender divisions in the workplace. Although the gender gap between the number of men and women in the workplace is narrowing, there are still stark differences in earnings and occupations (Reskin & Hartmann, 1986).

Additionally, gender divisions have permeated the field of music. A 2016 study investigating sex stereotyping of musical instruments found that middle school beginning band students unanimously categorized the tuba as a “boy instrument” and the flute and clarinet as “girl instruments” (Wrape, Dittloff, Callahan, 2016). Gender divisions are also reflected in professional organizations in music. A 2001 survey of membership in the Music Educators National Conference (MENC) found that in general, women outnumber men two to one in general music, choral, private studio, and keyboard instruction. In the areas of band instruction and music administrative roles, men outnumber women two to

one, as well as outweighed women three to one in the area of jazz instruction (MENC, 2001).

Specifically, the profession of conductor often reflects gender division in the field of music. Conducting music is a multifaceted art form that includes, among other things, nonverbal communication. Evaluations made from the observation of nonverbal communication can affect the perceived effectiveness of the conductor, which may in turn affect opinions of their job performance (Van Weelden, 2002). Previous research has cited historical precedent, traditional socialization, discrimination, segregation, and lack of female role model conductors as factors that contribute to the small number of female conductors (Gould, 2005). Although there is much research on the prevalence of gender trends in music, there is no known investigation of the effect of gender of conductor on musical evaluations.

The purpose of this study was to investigate the effect of conductor gender on musical assessments. Specifically, the research questions that guided the study were: 1) Is there a difference in the rating of ensemble performance between male and female conductors; 2) Is there a difference in the rating of overall conductor effectiveness between male and female conductors; and 3) Is there a difference in the rating of conductor nonverbal communication between male and female conductors.

The participants (N = 38) consisted of undergraduate music majors at a large southeastern university, as well as members of the 2016-2017 Florida Bandmasters Association membership. There were two groups of participants: 18 females and 20 males. The dependent measure was a survey created by the researcher. The survey asked participants to view four brief videos: two of male conductors, and two of female conductors. Filmed conductors were graduate students who had previous experience conducting a collegiate or secondary level ensemble, and were not known to the participants. All conductors were of similar race and body type in order to control for body and race bias.

All videos showed the conductors conducting the same piece of music. The repertoire chosen was a recording of Leonard Bernstein's *Overture to Candide*, performed by the United States Marine Band. Specifically, the researcher selected the same phrase of music for all four videos, time mark of 2:43-3:13. Although the same phrase of music was used, participants were led to believe that all videos featured performances by different ensembles. Participants were asked to rate the ensemble's performance, the technique of the ensemble, and the conductor's overall expressivity by selecting a rating on a provided five-point Likert type scale. Viewing order of the four videos was randomized to control for order effects.

Multiple three-way, between subjects analysis of variance tests were calculated to determine if there was a difference in the ratings of ensemble performance, conductor effectiveness, and overall conductor expressivity between male and female conductors and male and female participants. There was no significant difference between participant ratings of ensemble expressivity between male and female conductors. There was also no significant difference between the ratings of ensemble technique and overall conductor expressivity between male and female conductors. However, when analyzing the ratings of individual conductors, results suggest that a bias towards specific conductors affected the overall ratings for ensemble expressivity, ensemble technical performance, and conductor expressivity. This echoes findings in previous research that suggests conductor

nonverbal communication and behaviors impact musical assessments (VanWeelden, 2002). Although the researcher attempted to control for individual conductor bias, a preference for specific conductors was apparent. Interestingly, the preference of conductors for all three research questions despite a control for order effects was the same: Male Conductor 2, Female Conductor 1, Male Conductor 1, with Female Conductor 2 receiving the lowest mean ratings. Because of the alternating gender in the order of preference reflected by the ratings, these findings may imply that it was not the conductor's gender that affected the ratings, but rather their individual conducting behaviors.

References

- Gould, E. (2005). Nomadic turns: Epistemology, experience, and women university band directors. *Philosophy of Music Education Review*, 13(2), 147-164.
- Music Educators National Conference (2001). Gender trends among MENC music educators. *Teaching Music*, 8(6), 52-5
- Reskin, B. F., & Hartmann, H. I. (1986). *Women's work, men's work: Sex segregation on the job*. National Academies Press.
- U.S. Const. amend. XIX.
- VanWeelden, K., (2002). Relationships between perceptions of conducting effectiveness and ensemble performance. *Journal of Research in Music Education*, 50(2), 165-176.
- Wrape, E. R., Dittloff, A. L., & Callahan, J. L. (2016). Gender and musical instrument stereotypes in middle school children. Have trends changed? *Update: Applications of Research in Music Education*, 34(3), 40-47.

Eminent Composers in Educational Resources for Band

Wesley Brewer, Oregon State University

Studies of composer eminence have long been a part of music education research. Farnsworth (1962) examined the notion of composer eminence by employing Cattell's (1903) "space method" to study the physical space composers occupied in encyclopedia entry texts and comparing this measure of eminence with the opinions of members of the American Musicological Society. This was but one study in a long line of Farnsworth's research on composer eminence beginning in the 1940's and continuing through the 1960s (1945, 1957, 1963, 1966, 1969). In subsequent decades, researchers have returned to the concept of eminence to examine other facets of music education (Hamann & Lucas, 1998; Kratus, 1993; Randles, Hagen, Gottlieb, & Salvador, 2010; Standley, 1984).

Using content analysis methods, authors have investigated repertoire selection and music programming in both professional and educational performing organizations. Price (1990) examined orchestral programming trends while Price, Yarbrough, and Kinney (1990) compared the orchestral programming trends with the attitudes of university faculty to establish the eminence of American composers. Powell (2009) examined the programming trends of Big Ten university wind ensembles while Paul (2011) conducted a similar study using Pac Ten wind ensembles.

Authors also have studied the content of recommended, suggested, or required repertoire lists, published by state-level and professional music education organizations in the United States (Crochet, 2006; Oliver, 2012; Young, 1998; Stevenson, 2003). There is a long-running conversation about the varied quality and purposes of repertoire for band and these discussions illuminate larger concerns about the legitimacy of the wind band as a medium for serious artistry. Bands were a popular form of entertainment and social activity in the early 20th century but transitioned to being primarily affiliated with educational institutions, thereby creating a conflict of purpose, which subsequently permeated discussions of repertoire (Whitehill, 1969; Mantie, 2012).

Missing from previous research are two aspects of data that may be of interest to music educators: (a) studies that broadly include composers of less-difficult literature, and (b) studies that focus on recognition of the composers' overall output and contribution to the field rather than on the prominence of singular compositions.

Four research questions guided the current study:

1. Which composers are most eminent in the selected resources across all grade levels?
2. Which composers are most eminent in the selected resources at each grade level from 1 to 5+?
3. Which composers' music most often appears as an arrangement across all grade levels?
4. How do the results of the analysis inform the current state of band repertoire?

Method

Selection of lists was based on three criteria: (a) the list was publicly available for electronic download, (b) the list included at least five categories of music graded by difficulty, and (c) the list contained enough error-free information to identify the composer, grade level, and arranger for each piece. There is no consensus on the criteria and the procedure for grading band music. All lists in the study with the exception of two used a six-category scale from Grade 1 (easiest) to Grade 6 (most difficult); two lists used a five-category scale, with Grade 5 being the most difficult. For the purpose of analysis, I combined Grades 5 and 6 into Grade 5+. Table 1 shows the lists included in the study and the number of compositions from each list across grade levels ($N = 32,267$).

I calculated frequency scores from each list using SPSS descriptive statistics, counting the number of times a composer's name appeared in the list. The percentage of space occupied by each composer was found by dividing the frequency score by the total number of entries in each list. This approach was informed by Cattell (1903) and Farnsworth (1962), who focused on the concept of allocated space as a measure of eminence. The mean percentage scores resulted from adding all of a composer's percentage scores together and then dividing by 14 (the number of lists). The mean percentage score is the primary measure of eminence in this study. I repeated this procedure for each difficulty grading level and again for compositions listed with an arranger in order to examine which composers' music most often appeared as an arrangement.

Results

Results for the most eminent composers across all grade levels are shown in Table 2. For each grade level, the mean percentage of space occupied by each composer in the combined 14 lists is reported. The composer names are ordered in Table 2 by ranking the

results of overall mean percentage of space scores. In the remaining columns, the ranking (within each grade level result) is reported in parentheses next to the mean percentage of space. In instances where two composers have the same reported mean, I have given the higher ranking to the composer with the higher frequency score. Full results for the 25 most eminent composers at each individual grade level from 1 through 5+ are also available.

Discussion and Implications

Band continues to be one of the primary vehicles for music education in the United States (Abril & Gault, 2008). The location and selection of repertoire is an ongoing challenge and concern for band directors (Brewer & Rickels, 2014) and forms the basis for many curricular decisions. The results in Table 2 represent a curious mixture of well-known composers (i.e. J.S. Bach) and a group of composers who are less widely known or are known almost exclusively for their contributions to educational band literature (i.e. Anne McGinty). The findings illuminate two important elements of the wind band tradition: (a) adapting/adopting music from other genres and ensemble-types, and (b) creating graded literature that can be played by young musicians of various skill levels as they progress through the educational system. While the contributions of eminent composers of advanced wind literature have been well-documented in previous research (Paul, 2011; Powell, 2009) the contributions of composers who have prioritized writing for young students have been overlooked. The findings of this study invite further discussion about the how the quality of repertoire is judged, how those judgments are disseminated to members of the profession, and also about the enduring qualities and value of music by composers whose creations were not originally conceived for band.

References

- Abril, C. R., & Gault, B. M. (2008). The state of music in secondary schools: The principal's perspective. *Journal of Research in Music Education, 56*(1), 68-81.
- Brewer, W. D. & Rickels, D. A. (2014). A content analysis of social media interactions in the Facebook Band Directors Group. *Bulletin of the Council for Research in Music Education, 201*, 7-22.
- Cattell, J. M. (1903). A statistical study of eminent men. *Popular Science Monthly (LXII)*, 359-377.
- Crochet, L. S. (2006). Repertoire selection practices of band directors as a function of teaching experience, training, instructional level, and degree of success (Doctoral Dissertation). Retrieved from ProQuest Dissertations and Theses database. (UMI No. 3215250).
- Farnsworth, P. R. (1945). Musical eminence and year of birth. *The Journal of Aesthetics and Art Criticism, 4*(2), 107-109.
- Farnsworth, P. R. (1957). The limitations of Cattell's space method of studying eminence. *The Journal of Psychology, 44*(1), 169-173.
- Farnsworth, P. R. (1962). Elite attitudes in music as measured by the Cattell space method. *Journal of Research in Music Education, 10*(1) 65-68.
- Farnsworth, P. R. (1963). Attitudes toward composers as reflected in three general encyclopedias of the early 1960's. *Journal of Research in Music Education, 11*(2), 142-143.
- Farnsworth, P. R. (1966). Musicological attitudes on eminence. *Journal of Research in Music Education, 41*-44.

- Farnsworth, P. R. (1969). Encyclopedia favoritism toward native composers. *Journal of Research in Music Education*, 17(4), 405-407.
- Hamann, D. L., & Lucas, K. V. (1998). Establishing journal eminence in music education. *Journal of Research in Music Education*, 46(3), 405-413.
- Kratus, J. (1993). Eminence in music education research as measured in the Handbook of Research on Music Teaching and Learning. *Bulletin of the Council for Research in Music Education*, 118, 21-32.
- Mantie, R. (2012). Bands and/as music education antinomies and the struggle for legitimacy. *Philosophy of Music Education Review*, 20(1), 63-81.
- Oliver, T. W. (2012). A comparison and analysis of published lists of recommended wind band literature. *Journal of Band Research*, 47(2), 43-63.
- Paul, T. A. (2011). Pac-ten wind ensemble programming trends. *Journal of Band Research*, 47(1), 49-55.
- Powell, S. R. (2009). Recent programming trends of Big Ten university wind ensembles. *Journal of Band Research*, 44(2), 1-12.
- Price, H. E. (1990). Orchestral programming 1982-1987: An indication of musical taste. *Bulletin of the Council for Research in Music Education*, 106, 23-35.
- Price, H. E., Yarbrough, C., & Kinney, M. (1990). Eminence of American composers: University faculty attitudes and symphony orchestra programming. *Bulletin of the Council for Research in Music Education*, 106, 37-47
- Randles, C., Hagen, J., Gottlieb, B., & Salvador, K. (2010). Eminence in music education research as measured in the new handbook of research on music teaching and learning. *Bulletin of the Council for Research in Music Education*, 183, 65-76.
- Standley, J. M. (1984). Productivity and eminence in music research. *Journal of Research in Music Education*, 32(3), 149-157.
- Stevenson, J. R. (2003). *A survey and meta-analysis of selective wind band/ensemble music lists for the purpose of determining core repertoire at all difficulty levels*. Unpublished Masters Thesis, Peabody Conservatory of Music, Baltimore, MA.
- Whitehill, C. D. (1969). Sociological conditions which contributed to the growth of the school band movement in the United States. *Journal of Research in Music Education*, 17(2), 179-192.
- Young, C. S. (1998). *The quality of repertoire chosen by high school wind band conductors and the resources and criteria used to choose this literature*. (Doctoral dissertation, The Ohio State University).

Table 1. Distribution of compositions per grade level and organization

Organization	Gr. 1	Gr. 2	Gr. 3	Gr. 4	Gr. 5+	Total
Florida	105	250	282	218	643	1,498
Georgia	81	175	269	290	615	1,430
Iowa	0	46	101	134	128	409
Kentucky	39	237	297	245	383	1,201
Louisiana	258	374	488	462	560	2,142
Maryland	118	222	196	265	467	1,268
National Band Assoc.	75	368	435	376	728	1,982
Nebraska	43	131	190	137	238	739
North Carolina	172	392	377	465	754	2,160
Teaching Music. Series	101	167	159	160	319	906
Texas	152	196	278	230	298	1,154
Utah	0	223	707	566	1,006	2,502
Virginia	644	1,665	2,662	2,306	2,435	9,712
West Virginia	415	1,176	1,265	984	1,324	5,164
Total	2,203	5,622	7,706	6,838	9,898	32,267

Table 2. The 25 most eminent composers across all grade levels (N = 32,267)

Composer	Mean %	Std. Deviation	Frequency
Bach, Johann Sebastian	2.30	.91	657
Grainger, Percy Aldridge	1.94	.92	418
Curnow, James	1.42	1.47	491
Ticheli, Frank	1.42	.77	281
Sheldon, Robert	1.28	.58	427
Reed, Alfred	1.21	.88	309
Erickson, Frank	1.11	.48	366
Holst, Gustav	1.07	.45	256
McGinty, Anne	1.06	.47	411
Handel, George Frideric	1.05	.62	345
Grundman, Clare	1.02	.47	243
Del Borgo, Elliot	1.00	.40	402
Balmages, Brian	.87	.57	282
McBeth, W. Francis	.86	.50	212
Traditional	.84	.99	221
Holsinger, David	.83	.52	230
Swearingen, James	.82	.65	347
Wagner, Richard	.81	.39	240
Smith, Claude T.	.79	.34	254
Persichetti, Vincent	.79	.46	156
Mozart, Wolfgang Amadeus	.77	.40	268
Smith, Robert W.	.77	.63	321
Vaughan Williams, Ralph	.76	.36	163
La Plante, Pierre	.75	.37	173
Tchaikovsky, Peter Ilyich	.72	.51	281
Barnes, James	.68	.21	205

Key Elements of Preparation and Transition for an Instrumental Major Teaching Elementary General Music

Christa Kuebel, Case Western Reserve University

It is most common for music teachers to receive a K-12 or PK-12 music license (Groulx, 2015; Nixon May, Willie, Worthen, & Pehrson, 2016). In music teacher preparation programs, however, most preservice educators declare a specialization such as instrumental, choral, or general music, or focus their course study on one age group,

for example, secondary or elementary. With evidence of a large number of educators who have taught outside of their specialization at some point during their career (Conway, 2002; Groulx, 2015; Robinson, 2010; Shouldice, 2013), it is important to consider the preparedness of teachers to work outside of their focus area.

As early as Grade 3 Joseph, the participant, became involved with instrumental ensembles and private lessons. During his undergraduate teacher preparation program, he declared himself an “instrumental major” and completed the coursework related to this track. His student teaching focused on this area of specialization as he worked with sixth through twelfth grade bands and orchestras. He also taught private lessons and performed with local ensembles. Although his specialization was instrumental music, at the time of the study Joseph was working as an elementary general music teacher for students in to Kindergarten through second grade.

The purpose of the case study was to describe the experience of a first year music educator, Joseph, teaching outside of his specialization. Research questions included: 1) How has the participant navigated differences between his expected employment prior to graduation and the realities of his current teaching position? and 2) What critical experiences does the participant consider to be most relevant to his preparedness for achieving success in his current job? Data collection consisted of two semistructured interviews and classroom observations.

Three themes related to Joseph’s navigation of a job outside of his specialization. Interview questions related to the Realities of the Job Search uncovered the challenges Joseph faced when entering the job field. Although he wanted to work with secondary string students, there were not jobs of this type available in the location he needed to work. His Flexibility was demonstrated in his willingness to work in a position outside of his specialization. While discussing his ideal first job he stated, “I think I honestly envisioned myself taking whatever job was available. I just told myself I had to be ready for anything” (interview, March 3, 2016). Especially after realizing that the jobs available were not in his area of focus, Joseph quickly realized that flexibility while looking for employment was a necessity. Joseph also exhibited a strong sense of Self-efficacy that allowed him to persevere and remain positive during the challenges he faced as both a first year teacher and working outside of his specialization.

When discussing the critical experiences that most prepared Joseph for his job, he most commonly discussed *Professional Relationships and Undergraduate Preparation*. He discussed people that had been integral aspects of his musical journey, from those who influenced his choice to become a music educator to the colleagues that guided him through the challenging aspects of his first year of teaching. Specifically, he discussed his high school orchestra director, the other music teachers in his school district, and his mentor teacher. Joseph felt that the most significant preparation for taking an elementary general music teaching position was the general methods course he had taken during his undergraduate program. Activities and experience that Joseph mentioned as being valuable during general methods included discussing cognitive and vocal development of young children, working with administration, classroom management, observations, peer teaching, and lesson planning.

Implications for this research include the need for additional research in this area, the consideration of teacher educators to discuss and prepare undergraduate students for the possibility of working outside of their specializations, and the value of developing

self-efficacy among preservice teachers. Joseph's experiences also illustrated the importance of a mentor for early-career music educators. Joseph's experiences provided insight into the real life experiences of a music teacher who has pursued a teaching position outside of his specialization. He provided thoughtful reflections on how he approached the situation and his preparedness. Regardless of his career choices in the future, Joseph will learn from every teaching situation he encounters because "whatever you put in my way I'm going to do my absolute best" (interview, March 3, 2016).

References

- Conway, C. M. (2003). An examination of district-sponsored beginning music teacher mentor practices. *Journal of Research in Music Education, 51*, 6-23. doi:10.2307/3345645
- Groulx, T. J. (2015). Perceptions of course value and issues of specialization in undergraduate music teacher education curricula. *Journal of Music Teacher Education. doi:10.1177/1057083714564874*
- Nixon May, B., Willie, K., Worthen, C., & Pehrson, A., (2016, March). An analysis of state music education certification practices in the United States. Presented at the National Association for Music Research and Teacher Education National Conference, Atlanta, GA.
- Robinson, M. (2010). From the band room to the general music classroom: Why instrumentalists choose to teach general music. *Bulletin of the Council for Research in Music Education, 185*, 33-48.
- Shouldice, H. N. (2013). Trading Hindemith for "Hugs, High-fives, and Handshakes" One preservice music teacher's decision to teach elementary general music. *Bulletin of the Council for Research in Music Education, 195*, 41-57. doi: 10.5406/bulcouresmusedu.195.0041

An Alternative to Peter Webster's 'Musical Creativity'? An Ecological Approach

Rebecca Rinsema, Northern Arizona University

Peter Webster's work on musical creativity has had a long-standing impact on the way music educators conceive of musical creativity. Webster published a model of musical creativity derived from the literature on musical creativity in 1992. In 2002, he revised that model and called it 'Model of Creative Thinking Process in Music.' In this paper, I identify the advantages and disadvantages of Webster's definition of musical creativity that accompanied his 2002 model and propose an alternative that addresses the disadvantages of Webster's definition.

Webster's definition is as follows: The engagement of the mind in the active, structured process of thinking in sound for the purpose of creating some process that is new for the creator.¹

¹ Peter Webster, "Creative Thinking in Music: Advancing a Model," in *Creativity and Music Education*, eds. Timothy Sullivan and Lee Willingham (Edmonton, AB: Canadian Music Educators' Association, 2002), 20.

An advantage of Webster's definition is that it seems consistent with creative processes related to composing music within the European classical music tradition. Such processes have historically included composers audiating sounds in their minds in order to record them in the form of written notation. Such audiations are identified in Webster's definition as engagements of the mind that are active and structured and constitute 'thinking in sound.' Webster also builds a time element into his model that seems consistent with composition processes in the classical tradition. Between the composers 'Product Intention' and 'Creative Product' there occurs a 'Thinking Process,' which, occurs over time. For the classical composer, there is, indeed, a (sometimes extended) period of time between the intention and the product; and it seems reasonable that composers would engage in what Webster calls the 'thinking process' during that time.

Webster's definition and general model seems less suited to describing musical creativity and composition within other traditions. For example, it seems possible that Webster's necessary condition of 'thinking in sound,' which he links to the concept of mental representation, may not occur for some of today's popular music producers who manipulate sounds through digital means. Some producers might audiate in this way. But it's also possible that some of them manipulate the sounds as they hear them in real physical space, rather than in mental space.

Another problem arises with Webster's time element, as represented by the 'thinking process.' For those who engage with musical improvisation or what I call 'in action' musical creativities, this seems, at least, to not to occur at all and, at most, to occur in a different way when compared to composers in the classical tradition. This seems apparent whether we are talking about improvisation within the jazz, hip hop, or electronic music traditions, among the myriad of others. Webster, indeed, addresses this time problem with the caveat that the thinking process may be extremely short for those who engage in improvisation. For me, this caveat raises the question of whether the 'thinking process' should have such a prominent place in the model at all.

Webster consistently appeals to 'mental representation' in descriptions of his definition of musical creativity and the model itself. His use of this concept seems to be based in the representational model of perception, which has strongly influenced perceptual theory throughout the twentieth century. But, arguments against the theory continue to mount; alternative theories, like James Gibson's and Alva Noë's ecological and 'enactive' theories of perception, which are based on action rather than representation, are beginning to take more of solid place in the philosophy of perception.

Based on these theories, I propose the following alternative definition of musical creativity, which seems to solve the problems mentioned above: Musical creativity is acting with sound for the purpose of creating some product that is new for the creator. This definition allows both improvisation and music listening to be understood as creative activities on their own terms.

The definition works for music listening as long as we also consider perception to be a form of both understanding and action. In the case of listening and according to the results of the study, the product that is new for the creator is the music listening experience, in and of itself, and the acting with sound is the construction of that musical experience in all its mental and physical forms and technological means.

Music Teacher Evaluation, Instructional Quality, and Marginalized Populations: A Tale of Philosophical Dissonance and Perverse Incentives

Karen Salvador, University of Michigan-Flint

The recent reauthorization of the Elementary and Secondary Education Act (Elementary and Secondary Education Act [ESEA], 2015) known as the Every Student Succeeds Act (ESSA), no longer explicitly requires teacher evaluation per se. However, ESSA obliges states to evaluate teacher quality for mandatory reporting regarding factors such as educational equity (ESSA, 2015). Moreover, recent Department of Education (DoE) regulations related to the Higher Education Act (HEA) mandate state-determined measures of student outcomes that “meaningfully differentiate among teachers” in order to measure teacher preparation program effectiveness (US Department of Education, 2016). Thus, as the DoE language makes clear, “[s]tates that received ESEA flexibility or a Race to the Top grant may well have a head start in implementing systems for linking academic growth data for elementary and secondary school students to individual novice teachers, and then linking data on these novice teachers to individual teacher preparation programs” (§ 612.5 p. 35). As the HEA language indicates, states are heavily invested in systems for evaluating teacher quality, and rhetoric in state and local governance revolves around eliminating “bad teachers.” In addition, analysts and advocacy groups seem to agree “[s]trong teacher evaluation systems should form the backbone of states’ efforts to improve teacher preparation, equity, and development under ESSA” (Connally, 2016). Therefore, despite the adoption of ESSA, high-stakes standardized teacher evaluation will likely continue with little change in many states, particularly the 42 states that had ESEA waivers.

While teacher evaluation ostensibly is intended to increase teacher quality and the effectiveness of educator preparation programs, in this paper we argue that standardized, high-stakes teacher evaluation actually reduces music instructional quality, particularly with regard to inclusion and cultural responsiveness. We begin with a brief critical review of both the literature regarding marginalized populations in school music education (e.g., Elpus, 2014; Elpus & Abril 2011; Lind & McCoy 2016; Salvador & Allegood, 2014) and also music teacher evaluation (e.g., Robinson, 2015; Shaw, 2016).

Then, we use fictionalized vignettes to illustrate our analysis of the philosophical dissonances and perverse incentives inherent in music teacher evaluation and how they manifest in three broad categories: (1) contributing to the gap between theory and practice, creating dissonance between teachers’ philosophies and classroom practices by inappropriately driving curricular and instructional decision making, including assessment of student learning; (2) misusing measurement tools originally intended for teacher development as punitive high stakes evaluations, eroding the expert status of music educators and rendering them impotent as agents of change; and (3) forcing teachers to remain in the status quo, unable to stray from formulaic “markers of quality” to take the risks necessary for creativity, innovation, inclusion and cultural responsiveness. We argue that each of these three manifestations contributes to a reduction in music instructional quality overall and specifically for marginalized

populations. We conclude the paper with specific suggestions for music teachers who wish to resist these effects of teacher evaluation on their instruction.

References

- Connally, K. (2016, January 20). How will ESSA influence states' teacher quality efforts? Retrieved from: https://www.newamerica.org/education-policy/edcentral/essa_teacherquality/
- Elementary and Secondary Education Act of 1965. (2015). See Every Student Succeeds Act.
- Elpus, K. (2014). Evaluating the effect of No Child Left Behind on US music course enrollments. *Journal of Research in Music Education*, 0022429414530759.
- Elpus, K., & Abril, C. R. (2011). High school music ensemble students in the United States: A demographic profile. *Journal of Research in Music Education*, 59, 128-145. doi: 10.1177/0022429411405207
- Every Student Succeeds Act. (2015). Pub. L. No. 114-95 § 114 Stat 1177. Retrieved from: <https://www.congress.gov/bill/114th-congress/senate-bill/1177/text>
- Lind, V. & McCoy, C. (2016). *Culturally responsive teaching in music education: From understanding to application*. New York: Routledge.
- National Association for Music Education (2014). NAFME Teacher Evaluation Position Statement. Downloaded from http://www.nafme.org/wpcontent/files/2014/07/teacher_evaluation.pdf
- O'Neil, Cathy (2016). *Weapons of math destruction: How big data increases inequality and threatens democracy*. New York: Crown Random House.
- Robinson, M. (2015). The inchworm and the nightingale: On the (mis)use of data in music teacher evaluation. *Arts Education Policy Review*, 116(1), 9-21. doi: 10.1080/10632913.2014.944966
- Salvador, K. & Allegood, K. (2014). Access to Music Education with Regard to Race in Two Urban Areas. *Arts Education Policy Review*, 115(3), 82-92. doi:10.1080/10632913.2014.914389
- Shaw, R. D. (2016) Arts teacher evaluation: How did we get here? *Arts Education Policy Review*, 117(1), 1-12. doi: 10.1080/10632913.2014.992083
- US Department of Education. (2016). 34 CFR Parts 612 and 686 *Teacher Preparation Issues*. Retrieved from: <http://www2.ed.gov/documents/teaching/teacher-prep-final-regs.pdf>

Themes of Caring: A Case Study of an Elementary General Music Teacher

Megan Wick, University of Colorado-Boulder

In the field of education, extensive research has been conducted on teacher effectiveness. Characteristics of teacher effectiveness that have been studied include: instructional delivery, student assessment, learning environment, and personal qualities (Stronge, Ward and Grant, 2011). Among these characteristics, the vocational aspects of teacher effectiveness have drawn more of a research focus as compared to the more 'human' quality of teaching including personal qualities (Velasquez, West, Graham, & Osguthorpe, 2013). One notable feature of personal qualities of teachers includes teacher

care for students. The concept of care has been shown to play an important role in both teacher effectiveness and student achievement (Stronge, 2007). Stronge (2007) also states, "Effective teachers care about their students and demonstrate that they care in such a way that their students are aware of it" (p. 23).

The philosophy of care in education has been applied to a moderate body of research within the field of general education. Much of the existing research on teacher care for students is based upon Nel Noddings' care ethics. Noddings' writings of care ethics in education is among the foremost philosophies of care in education. When considering the body of research in music education, there has not been a significant focus on the premise of teacher care for students. Thus, it is imperative that we consider a research focus on the basis of teacher care for students within music education. In a rare dissertation focusing on high school band students' perceptions of care, Lalama (2013, pg. 104) states, "Caring is an essential part of human relationships and high school bands are in a position to foster a caring climate that can influence student behavior. Student perceptions can differ according to group, but the fundamental need to feel cared for is undeniable, especially for adolescent students who need social and emotional stability."

What we can draw from Lalama's statement, is that it is important that we look at care in different settings within the field of music education because of this fundamental need of students. In doing so, the effects could potentially improve teacher effectiveness and may also have a positive impact on student achievement.

The primary purpose of this study will be to examine the ways an elementary general music teacher cares for his students. A criterion sampling strategy (Patton, 1990) was chosen for this intrinsic case study (Stake, 1995). An intrinsic case study is used "to illustrate a unique case, a case that has usual interest in and of itself and needs to be described and detailed" (Creswell, 2013, pg. 98). The criterion for the selection of the participant were, success as an elementary general music teacher, and also the unique aspects to the teaching and curricular approach. The researcher wanted a more in-depth look at ways of caring for students had led to the teacher's success in the classroom, and that other elementary general music teachers may learn from those processes.

The research questions guiding the study will be as follows: (a) In what ways does a teacher show and demonstrate care for students? (b) How does a teacher's care for students impact the curricular approach? (c) How does a teacher's past experiences influence curricular approach and the ways in which they demonstrate care for students? I will conduct four interviews, three field observations and document collection. This will be a continuation of a study that was started in the fall of 2015. The study was started as part of a qualitative research class in which two interviews, two field observations and document collection was done over the period of nine weeks. I will build upon that research by conducting (at least) two more interviews, one more field observation, and further data collection. The second round of data collection should be completed by the end of December.

I will use Nel Noddings' philosophy of care ethics in education as a framework for this study (Noddings, 1998). Noddings contends that care ethics within education consist of four key components: modeling, dialogue, practice and confirmation. I plan to code data based on emerging themes in order to create a conceptual framework (Miles, Huberman, & Saldana, 2013). Implications will be discussed for current and future music

educators and future research. This study will add to the existing body of literature by looking further into the teacher's idea of care in an elementary, general music setting.

References

- Creswell, J. W. (2013). *Research design: Qualitative, quantitative, and mixed methods approaches*. Sage publications.
- Miles, M. B., Huberman, A. M., & Saldaña, J. (2013). *Qualitative data analysis: A methods sourcebook*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage Publications.
- Noddings, N. (1998). *Philosophy of Education*. Boulder, CO: Westview.
- Patton, M. Q. (1990). *Qualitative Evaluation and Research Methods*. SAGE Publications, Inc.
- Stake, R. E. (1995). *The Art of Case Study Research*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage Publications.
- Stronge, J. H. (2007). *Qualities of effective teachers*. Alexandria, VA: Association for Supervision and Curriculum Development.
- Stronge, J. H., Ward, T. J., & Grant, L. W. (2011). What makes good teachers good? A cross-case analysis of the connection between teacher effectiveness and student achievement. *Journal of Teacher Education*, 62(4), 339-355.
- Velasquez, A., West, R., Graham, C., & Osguthorpe, R. (2013). Developing caring relationships in schools: a review of the research on caring and nurturing pedagogies. *Review of Education*, 1(2), 162-190.